



New York Appellate Division Construes the “Caused By” Language In an Additional Insured Provision Broadly

On January 19, 2012, the New York Appellate Division, First Department, in *W & W Glass Sys., Inc. v. Admiral Ins. Co.*, 2012 N.Y. Slip Op 305 (N.Y. App. Div. 2012) unanimously affirmed the lower court’s decision that the “caused by” language in an additional insured provision must be interpreted as broadly as the “arising out of” language contained in certain additional insured provisions. This decision will certainly have wide-ranging implications in cases involving additional insured provisions that include the “caused by” language.

In this case, the general contractor sought a declaration that it was entitled to defense and indemnification from the subcontractor’s insurer with respect to an underlying personal injury brought by an employee of the subcontractor. The subcontractor purchased a commercial general liability policy that provided the general contractor with additional insured coverage “only with respect to liability caused by [the subcontractor’s] ongoing operations performed for that insured [i.e., the plaintiff].” The policy also provided that it “does not apply to liability caused by the sole negligence of the person or organization [named as an additional insured].”

In agreeing with the lower court’s decision, the Appellate Division explicitly rejected the insurer’s argument that the “caused by” language must be construed more narrowly than the “arising out of” language, holding that the “caused by” language “does not materially differ” from the “arising out of” language. Regarding the insurer’s argument, the Appellate Division further held that the “caused by” language does not require negligence on the part of the subcontractor in order to trigger coverage for the general contractor. The Appellate Division found that the claim involved an employee of the subcontractor who was injured while performing the subcontractor’s work under the subcontract, thereby triggering additional insured coverage. Thus, notwithstanding that the “caused by” language appears to require a more stringent standard, the Appellate Division applied the same liberal standard it applies to policies with the “arising out of” language in holding that the mere employment status of the injured claimant is sufficient to trigger additional insured coverage. The Appellate Division, therefore, affirmed the lower court’s declaration that the insurer had a duty to defend the general contractor in the underlying action and awarded it past defense costs.

This decision highlights the need for insurers to examine additional insured provisions containing the “caused by” language in the same manner as those containing the “arising out of” language. Unless this decision is overturned by the Court of Appeals, at least with regard to matters pending in the First Department, the “caused by” language cannot be construed as requiring an act or omission on the part of the named insured in order to trigger additional insured coverage.

Should you need more information on these issues, please feel free to contact us.

About Coughlin Duffy LLP

Coughlin Duffy LLP is one of the fastest growing law firms in the northeastern United States, servicing a sophisticated national and international clientele. We provide a full range of legal services including all types of litigation, arbitration and transactional work on behalf of corporate, institutional, governmental and individual clients.

The materials presented herein are for information purposes only and are not offered as legal advice. No reader should act on the basis of these materials without seeking appropriate professional advice as to the particular facts and applicable law involved. Opinions presented herein are the opinions of the individual authors, and do not necessarily reflect the opinion of the firm of Coughlin Duffy LLP, or any of its attorneys or clients.

New Jersey
350 Mount Kemble Avenue
Morristown, N.J. 07962
Tel: 973-267-0058
Fax: 973-267-6442

New York
88 Pine Street, 28th Floor
New York, N.Y. 10005
Tel: 212-483-0105
Fax: 212-480-3899



Adam M. Smith
Partner
Tel: 212-612-4995
ASmith@CoughlinDuffy.com



Steven D. Cantarutti
Associate
Tel: 973-631-6060
SCantarutti@CoughlinDuffy.com